NC Balance of State CoC Special Steering Committee Meeting Minutes – CoC Project Ranking

August 22, 2023

Regional Leads Present: Derek Lancour, Emily Lowery, Amber Story, Pamela Hinton, Kristen McAlhaney, Natasha Elliott, Dr. Dia Thomas, LaTasha McNair, Kisha Darden, Catonnia Pitt, Brian Fike

At-Large Members Present: Melissa Hewitt, Rachelle Dugan, Ellen Blackman, Catherine Kastleman, Angela Harper King, Lisa Phillips

SC Members Absent: Tiffany Askew, Brooks Ann McKinney, Cassandra Rowe, Marie Watson, James Stroud

Interested Parties Present: Akeem McDuffie, Christina Rary, Casey McCall, Bre Griffin, Crystal Gwendo, Denice Ariztia, Kerry Bashaw, Kristine Wiles, Laurenn Singleton, Leah Dyson, Mary Erwin, Shaneitha Lee, Veronica Murphy, Zinia Holley, Alyce Knaflich, Teena Willis, Lori Watts, Amy Modlin, Melissa Elliott

NCCEH Staff Present: Brian Alexander, Laurel Benfield, Allie Card, Jenny Simmons, Ashley VonHatten

Scoring Process/Project Applications

The CoC Consolidated Application has 3 parts

CoC Application	Captures CoC-wide information
	NCCEH, as Collaborative Applicant, writes this application on the CoC's behalf
	Input from agencies, Regional Committees, Steering Committee, and stakeholders necessary to give full scope of the CoC's work
Project Applications	New projects
	Renewal projects
	DV Bonus project
	CoC Planning grant
Project Priority Ranking List	Ranked list of each project
	Recommended by the Project Review Committee
	Approved by the Steering Committee

The Project Review Committee plays a crucial role in the application process.

● Composed of one representative from each Regional Committee & interested at-large Steering Committee members (conflict-free -- not grantees or applicants)
● Scores new & renewal project applications using approved scorecards
● Recommends ranked list of new & renewal project applications for CoC Collaborative Application to the Steering Committee for approval

Scoring & ranking projects allows the CoC to prioritize funding for the best projects. The scoring and ranking process:

● Allows the CoC to prioritize funding based on HUD & CoC priorities and needs
● Ensures the CoC prioritizes funding for projects that have high performance & manage funds well
● Required by HUD

The CoC has over $16.6 million in homeless funding at stake in the FY2023 CoC Program competition.

Potential Amount Available to NC Balance of State CoC Applicants	
Annual Renewal Demand (ARD)	$13,191,053
Bonus Funding	$1,106,132
DV Bonus	$1,580,188
CoC Planning (not scored or ranked)	$790,094
Projects will be ranked within 2 tiers	
Tier 1: 93% ARD	$12,267,679
Tier 2: ARD - Tier 1 + CoC Bonus + Domestic Violence Bonus	$3,609,694

Project ranking was informed by the CoC's Funding Priorities & the scorecards. The FY2023 CoC Program Funding Priorities document provides guidance from the Continuum of Care on its priorities for funding. This includes priorities for funding specific project types and regional needs.

The approved new & renewal scorecards organize evaluation using:

- Thresholds: Essential components that must be met in order to be funded.
- Standards: High priorities for projects to ideally meet that indicate programmatic success.
- Minimums: Meeting section minimums indicates well-rounded projects and that essential components are not missing that could affect performance.
- Points: Used to incentivize practices and to pull higher performing projects up in the ranking list.

The PRC & NCCEH staff used approved scorecards to review applications.

- Two Types of Scoring:
  - Combined Scoring section of each application scored by:
    - One member of the PRC
    - One member of NCCEH staff
    - Combined Scoring section scores are averaged.
    - Threshold & standards discrepancies are reconciled by an additional staff member.
  - Staff Scoring section scored by NCCEH staff
  - Combined Scoring + Staff Scoring = Total Score

FY2023 CoC Application Summary

Applications scored and ranked	25 renewal project applications
	    18 Permanent Supportive Housing
	     7 Rapid Rehousing
	
	  3 new project applications
	    2 Rapid Rehousing
	    1 SSO-CE DV Bonus projects

Applications not scored but ranked (renewals typically ranked as first projects)	1 HMIS grant renewal application 1 SSO-CE grant renewal application 1 new HMIS grant expansion application
Applications not scored or ranked	1 Planning grant application

Renewal Project Scoring Overview

Renewal project summary:

- 27 renewal projects turned in applications.
    - (1) HMIS project (not scored)
    - (1) SSO-Coordinated Entry project (not scored)
    - (18) Permanent Supportive Housing projects
    - (7) Rapid Rehousing projects

- Scored renewal projects:
    - (0) applications with threshold issues
    - (16) applications were late or missing submission materials (Standard)

Renewal applicants missed a range of standards.

Housing First Standard

Standards Missed	Number of Renewals
Housing First	0 agencies, 0 projects

Key Elements and Benchmarks

Standards Missed	Number of Renewals
PSH Key Elements	1 agency, 2 projects
RRH Benchmarks	5 agencies, 5 projects

New Project Review

Four new projects turned in applications.

- (2) Rapid rehousing projects
- (1) HMIS expansion project
- (1) DV Bonus project
    - (1) SSO-CE

New project comparison

Project	Project Type	Funding Priority	Thresholds Missed	Minimums missed	Total points
Trillium RRH #2	RRH	2	0	2	96.5
NCORR	RRH	NA	0	2	60.5
NCCEH SSO-CE DV Bonus	SSO-CE	NA	0	2	69.5
NCCEH HMIS expansion	HMIS	NA	NA	NA	NA

Most new applicants met all key thresholds and standards.

Housing First Standard

Standards Missed	Number of Renewals
Housing First	0 agencies, 0 projects

Key Elements and Benchmarks

Standards Missed	Number of Renewals
PSH Key Elements	0 agencies, 0 projects
RRH Benchmarks	0 agencies, 0 projects

Ranking Options

The PRC used timeliness & historical precedent to order the final ranking list.

The Project Review Committee used the timeliness & completeness standard as the first way to order renewal projects in the ranking list.

- 8 agencies with 16 projects submitted incomplete or late materials.

The Project Review Committee also used several historical precedents including some key standards to order the final ranking list.

- Program Design Elements
    - Key Elements of Permanent Supportive Housing
    - USICH Rapid Rehousing Benchmarks
- Anti-Discrimination Policy adherence

Precedent 1: Infrastructure applications

- CoC precedent is to rank the NC BoS CoC HMIS and Coordinated Entry renewal applications at the top of the ranking list.

- o Protects required infrastructure
- o Funding Priorities document prioritizes infrastructure grants

Precedent 2: DV Bonus applications

- ● CoC precedent is to rank DV Bonus projects at the bottom of the ranking list.
  - o One application with far ranging impacts for DV survivors
    - ▪ NCCEH Supportive Services Only – Coordinated Entry
  - o Size could eliminate other projects, if higher in the ranking list

Precedent 3: Use Program Design Standards & Anti-Discrimination Policy Standards to order renewal projects.

- ● Pull up projects in groups for the number of Key Elements of PSH or RRH Benchmarks met

  - o Group by standards met and then ordered by point total

- ● Pull down projects missing the Anti-Discrimination Policy standard

  - o One agency with three projects

    - ▪ Community Link: Northern PSH, Piedmont 1 PSH, and PRC RRH

The PRC decided to reallocate the Community Link RRH renewal project due to performance & standards issues.

- ● The Project Review Committee reallocated the Community Link RRH renewal project due to:
  - o Lowest scoring renewal project that was in operation for at least one year
  - o Missed 4/15 RRH program standards
  - o Missed Anti-Discrimination Policy adherence standard
  - o Low performance scoring
  - o Last renewal project on the ranked list with overall score lower than comparable new RRH applications

The PRC used the FY2023 CoC Program Funding Priorities document how to order & choose new projects for the ranking list.

- ● Per funding priorities, the PRC ranked the NCCEH HMIS expansion project as the first new project in Tier 2.
  - ● Maintaining infrastructure is a top priority for the CoC
  - ● The NC BoS CoC has had a funding shortfall for the last two years to pay the HMIS Lead for access to HMIS@NCCEH.
    - o NCCEH has filled this gap with returned annual ESG and ESG-CV funding, but these resources will not be available moving forward.
    - o The CoC needs a sustainable resource to pay for increased HMIS costs.
    - o The CoC has not increased the amount of HMIS since the original grant was awarded.

- The PRC chose to include the NC Office of Recovery & Resiliency RRH project as the final new project in the ranking list.
  - Met all RRH Program Standards & Anti-Discrimination Policy
  - Covers all 79 counties in the CoC
  - Ability to bring housing & healthcare leverage, which will add points to the CoC Consolidated Application, increasing the chances of more Tier 2 awards
  - Adds capacity to Back@Home Balance of State rehousing program
  - Includes Regions 5 & 11
    - New Trillium RRH #2 project application to cover R11 not included in the ranking list
    - Renewal Community Link RRH project application to cover R05 not included in the ranking list

The PRC final Tier 2 ranking list includes two new projects.

	NC0221L4F032212	Community Link, Programs of Travelers Aid	Northern PSH Combo			Renewal	PH: PSH	117
26			TIER 1 Portion $762,682.00	$12,267,679.00				
			TIER 2 Portion $575,337.00	$12,843,016.00				
		North Carolina Coalition To End Homelessness		$ 13,093,016.00				
27			HMIS	$ 250,000.00		New	HMIS	0
		North Carolina Office of Recovery and Resiliency (NCORR)		$ 14,297,185.00				
28			Back@Home-BoS Annual RRH	$1,204,169.00		New	RRH	60.5
			TIER 2 Funding Line					
			NOT FUNDED					
NR		Trillium Health Resources	Trillium RRH #2	$ 198,100.00	Not funded	New	RRH	96.5
NR	NC0125L4F032214	Community Link, Programs of Travelers Aid	PRC RRH	$ 348,037.00	Not funded	Renewal	PH: RRH	45
		North Carolina Coalition To End Homelessness		DV Bonus				
29			NC BoS CoC DV Bonus SSO-CE	$ 963,600.00		New	SSO-CE	69.5
			DV Bonus Total	$ 963,600.00				

Final Recommended Prioritization Ranking List

Rank	Grant Number	Agency	Project Name	ARA / Request	Running Balance	App Type	Project Type	TOTAL
1	NC0035L4F032215	NCCEH	2023 HMIS Renewal BoS	$ 519,299.00	$ 519,299.00	Renewal	HMIS	
2	NC0384L4F032205	NCCEH	2023 SSO-CE Renewal BoS	$ 423,767.00	$ 943,066.00	Renewal	SSO-CE	
3	NC0240L4F032207	Vaya Health	Vaya Health Central Combo	$ 495,134.00	$ 1,438,200.00	Renewal	PH: PSH	165.5
4	NC0255L4F032210	Vaya Health	SPC Western Combo	$ 435,590.00	$ 1,873,790.00	Renewal	PH: PSH	153
5	NC0238L4F032207	Eastpointe	Shelter Plus Care 3	$ 228,568.00	$ 2,102,358.00	Renewal	PH: PSH	132.5
6	NC0262L4F032211	Eastpointe	Shelter + Care 1	$ 199,127.00	$ 2,301,485.00	Renewal	PH: PSH	125.5
7	NC0198L4F032210	Rockingham County Help for Homeless, Inc.	Permanent Supportive Housing	$ 269,200.00	$ 2,570,685.00	Renewal	PH: PSH	119
8	NC0358L4F032206	Eastpointe	Shelter Plus Care Southeast	$ 80,287.00	$ 2,650,972.00	Renewal	PH: PSH	104
9	NC0507L4F032200	Diakonos, Inc.	Fifth Street Ministries Permanent Supportive Housing	$ 140,000.00	$ 2,790,972.00	Renewal	PH: PSH	54.5
10	NC0506L4F032200	Brick Capital Community Development Corporation	Region 7 Permanent Supportive Housing	$ 298,658.00	$ 3,089,630.00	Renewal	PH: PSH	26
11	NC0507L4F032200	Central Piedmont Community Action, Inc.	CPCA Breaking Barriers RRH 2022	$ 275,547.00	$ 3,365,177.00	Renewal	PH: RRH	30.5
12	NC0040L4F032215	Trillium Health Resources	PSH #1	$1,125,984.00	$ 4,491,161.00	Renewal	PH: PSH	126
13	NC0159L4F032209	Housing Authority of the City of Greenville	Seeds of Change	$ 355,560.00	$ 4,846,721.00	Renewal	PH: PSH	117
14	NC0281L4F032209	Thrive	Pathways to PH	$ 386,629.00	$ 5,233,350.00	Renewal	PH: PSH	110
15	NC0239L4F032209	Housing Authority of the City of Greenville	Project Stable Solutions	$ 70,491.00	$ 5,303,841.00	Renewal	PH: PSH	107
16	NC0042L4F032215	Partners Health Management	Partners Consolidated Renewal 2022	$ 273,381.00	$ 5,577,222.00	Renewal	PH: PSH	106.5
17	NC0237L4F032207	Housing Authority of the City of Greenville	Project HOPE	$ 508,016.00	$ 6,085,238.00	Renewal	PH: PSH	102
18	NC0183L4F032213	Housing Authority of the City of Greenville	Solid Ground	$ 74,028.00	$ 6,159,266.00	Renewal	PH: PSH	85

Rank	Grant Number	Agency	Project Name	ARA / Request	Running Balance	App Type	Project Type	TOTAL
19	NC0509L4F032200	Housing Authority of the City of Greenville	Project LIFE	$ 369,720.00	$ 6,528,986.00	Renewal	PH: PSH	55
20	NC0466L4F032201	Thrive	Thrive RRH	$ 217,952.00	$ 6,746,938.00	Renewal	PH: RRH	45
21	NC0465D4F032201	NCCADV	Safe at Home	$3,123,385.00	$ 9,870,323.00	Renewal	PH: RRH	34
22	NC0410L4F032204	Union County Community Shelter	CoC Rapid Rehousing UCCS	$ 200,148.00	$ 10,070,471.00	Renewal	PH: RRH	66
23	NC0409L4F032204	Pitt County Planning and Development	PittRRH	$ 123,278.00	$ 10,193,749.00	Renewal	PH: RRH	104
24	NC0446L4F032203	Trillium Health Resources	Trillium RRH	$ 212,039.00	$ 10,405,788.00	Renewal	PH: RRH	109.5
25	NC0045L4F032215	Community Link, Programs of Travelers Aid	Piedmont 1 PSH	$1,099,209.00	$ 11,504,997.00	Renewal	PH: PSH	119
	NC0221L4F032212	Community Link, Programs of Travelers Aid	Northern PSH Combo			Renewal	PH: PSH	117
26			TIER 1 Portion	$ 762,682.00	$12,267,679.00			
			TIER 2 Portion	$ 575,337.00	$12,843,016.00			
		North Carolina Coalition To End Homelessness			$ 13,093,016.00			
27			HMIS	$ 250,000.00		New	HMIS	0
		North Carolina Office of Recovery and Resiliency (NCORR)			$ 14,297,185.00			
28			Back@Home-BoS Annual RRH	$1,204,169.00		New	RRH	60.5
			TIER 2 Funding Line					
			NOT FUNDED					
NR		Trillium Health Resources	Trillium RRH #2	$ 198,100.00	Not funded	New	RRH	96.5
NR	NC0125L4F032214	Community Link, Programs of Travelers Aid	PRC RRH	$ 348,037.00	Not funded	Renewal	PH: RRH	45
29		North Carolina Coalition To End Homelessness	NC BoS CoC DV Bonus SSO-CE	$ 963,600.00	DV Bonus	New	SSO-CE	69.5

- The first 11 projects met the timeliness standard and were pulled up.
- 25 & 26 were pulled down as they did not meet the Anti-Discrimination Policy standard.

Questions:

- Derek Lancour requested to go back 1 slide to view the first half of the ranking list.

- Alyce Knaflich – should the amounts for Community Link be zero? Answer – this is an internal document and amounts are listed for reference.

Dr. Dia Thomas moved to accept the NC BoS CoC PRC's recommended prioritization ranking list for the FY23 CoC Competition. Lisa Phillips seconded the motion. The motion was unanimously approved.

Next Steps: Notification & Appeal Process

Staff will notify applicants regarding decisions by the end of the day.

- Staff will send scorecards to applicants & offer follow-up calls after the competition.
- Applicants whose projects were not included in the final Prioritization Ranking List can appeal decisions.

Appeals Process

- Appeal documentation due to NCCEH by Thursday, August 24th at 12 PM
- If appeals are submitted, the PRC will meet on Friday, August 25th to consider information.
- If the PRC recommends overturning a decision, the Steering Committee will consider approval of an updated prioritization ranking list on Tuesday, August 29th at 10:30 AM.

Next Steering Committee meeting

[TENTATIVE] CoC Appeals Meeting: Tuesday, August 29, 10:30 – 11:30 A.M.

NEXT REGULAR STEERING COMMITTEE MEETING:

Tuesday, September 12, 2023, at 10:30 A.M.